

Reconciling Two Contradictory Understandings about the Law of Tahlilan on Social Media Indonesia

by Sobhan Sobhan

Submission date: 04-Jul-2023 07:08PM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 2126403829

File name: nazku888r68444.pdf (587.19K)

Word count: 8855

Character count: 45426

Reconciling Two Contradictory Understandings about the Law of *Tahlilan* on Social Media Indonesia

Sobhan Sobhan^{1,*}, Mahyudin Ritonga² and Kholidah Kholidah¹

¹Department of Islamic Law, Faculty of Syari'ah and Law, Islamic University of Imam Bonjol, Padang, Indonesia

²Department of Arabic Language Education, Faculty of Islamic Studies, Muhammadiyah University of West Sumatra, Indonesia

Received: 2 Feb. 2022, Revised: 25 Apr. 2022, Accepted: 13 May. 2022.

Published online: 1 Mar. 2023

Abstract: The practice of *tahlilan* as one of the acts of worship in Islamic law is accommodated by some Muslims as a very important worship, especially at certain moments, and relies on arguments that do not want to be refuted. Meanwhile, there are other groups who reject the practice of *tahlilan* and desperately put forward arguments and arguments to defend their opinions, and some even conclude that it is a heretical practice. This article explains the pros and cons between the two opposing camps in the context of debating activities on social media. It will also bring together the two opposing camps with the principles of *wasathiyyah* in understanding the existing arguments as the basis for the practice of *tahlilan* worship. This research is a qualitative research with the main data source is the explanations of the two opposing camps on YouTube or literacy related to the research content. The findings of this study show that the activities of the camp that rejects *tahlilan* through social media illustrate a textual understanding of the arguments that are the basis for the *tahlilan* practice. Meanwhile, the camp that accepts and practices *tahlilan* understands the propositions contextually. This finding can have implications for the terminology of *tahlilan* worship as a religious leader in the new media era, which will coincide with the terminology of opinion makers and opinion leaders as new terminology in the new media era.

Keywords: Dissent; law of *tahlilan*; Reconciling, Social Media.

1 Introduction

Dissent among my people is a blessing (Arshad et al., 2012). Thus addressing the dissent that should be responding to differences that arise in the midst of society, including in understanding the law of *tahlilan*. *Tahlil* is a sentence of *Tawhid*, a pledge to glorify Allah swt with the words *Laa Ilaaha Illallaah* (There is no god but Allah). The sentence is very urgent in Islamic law. In the Quran, Allah swt expresses it in the form of a command (QS. Muhammad: 19). In the hadith of the Prophet, it is mentioned in various wording; some with the wording that whoever recites the phrase *tahlil* will get an enormous reward (Muslim, 4: 2971). It is also mentioned that whoever finishes saying the *tahlil* sentence before dying will also enter heaven (HR Ahmad, 3: 363). That is why the Islamic Shari'ah instructs the one who is about to die to say the *tahlil* (Abu Daud, 3:190). The Shari'ah's guidance on *tahlil* is so strong that it unites Muslims as a whole (Jalli et al., 2022; Ma'arif, 2022; Sirait, 2016; Nawawi et al., 2022).

The pro-*Tahlilan* camp quoted from the book *Tahlilan is Not a Death Party* by Abdul Aziz, Imam as-Syaukani expressed his opinion on this matter and he allowed the *tahlilan* case based on the hadith of the Prophet (Salafuddin, 2021). In addition, they also found information in the book *Pros and Cons of Tahlilan and Kenduri Death* by Isn'an Ansory, it is stated that *tahlilan* is included in the case of *bid'ah idhofiyyah*. This is because two things are included in this tradition. The first is sunnah muthlaq and the second is the limitation of sunnah muthlaq. Traditions are things whose specific procedures and times are not directly sourced from the Prophet. However, its practice has a basic foundation in Islamic law. Those who oppose *tahlilan* say that the fatwa of the scholars of Islam and their consensus on this issue, when the Companions reached a consensus on a matter such as the one we are discussing, then the *tabi'in* and *tabi'ut-tabi'in*, including the four Imams, and all Muslim scholars from time to time, followed the consensus of the Companions, which is that gathering at the place of the deceased and eating there is *haram* and is one of the customs of the Jahiliyyah (Mas'ari & Syamsuatir,

*Corresponding author e-mail: sobhan@uinib.ac.id

2017).

Seeing the continuous dispute above, the researcher will provide a solution that can bring together these different opinions, so that at least the camps do not attack each other even though they do not move away from their practice of *tahlilan*. This kind of work has been exemplified by the Prophet before he was appointed as a Messenger. When the Quraysh differed in opinion about who had the right to put Hajar Aswad to its original place, it was Al-Amin who succeeded in uniting them through the help of a shawl (Maulidi, 2021). Finally, everyone was happy even though they were not the ones who placed the Hajar Aswad stone, but by holding the end of the shawl, they felt that they had participated in placing it. In addition, from the beginning, the Prophet was not looking for who had the most rights, but how all of this was involved. This is a lesson for us that when there are people in dispute who do not take sides, that is what is called *wasatha* (QS. Al-Baqarah (2): 143).

This research is a field study with a qualitative method approach, emphasising more on the observation of phenomena and examining the substance of the meaning of these phenomena (Barber et al., 2023). The analysis and sharpness of qualitative research is greatly affected by the strength of the words and sentences used. Data were obtained by conducting in-depth observations of the statements of two opposing camps on the law of *tahlilan*, namely between representatives of *Ahlussunnah wal Jamaah* scholars as the pro *tahlilan* camp and representatives of *Salafi* scholars as the contra camp. The collected data were then organised into categories or themes which were then arranged according to the information obtained from the field (Suadi, 2018).

Looking at the importance of finding solutions and reconciling two disputing camps, that is where the importance of this research lies. Allah confirms, that *Indeed the believers are brothers, therefore reconcile between your two brothers (who are in dispute) and fear Allah that you may have mercy* (QS. Al-Hujurat (49): 10), followed by: *And if two groups of believers fight, then reconcile between them. If one of them wrongs the other, then fight the wrongdoer until he returns to the commandments of Allah* (Al-Hujurat (49): 10): 9). This paper will explain in full the arguments used by each camp when defending their opinions. It will also explain the ways in which they understand the arguments and what influences their opinions, as well as offer solutions that are solutive to be able to marry the two (Jamhari, 2001); (Warisno & Tabrani, 2018), so as to provide comfort in accepting the understanding of others or in practicing a practice in which there is *tahlilan*.

2 Method

This research is a qualitative study, describing the conditions of the conditions of two opposing camps when each of them presents their arguments in order to defend and defend their opinions (Macagno et al., 2022). The main data in this study was collected through in-depth interviews with two informants who were given the initials BHY and FA, respectively, to protect them from *cyberbullying* (Margono, 2019). In-depth interviews aim to find out the detailed background related to the reasons why the informants' answers are exclusive (Woo, 2022). The interviewees were selected randomly from scholars who support and practice *tahlil* and those who reject and do not practice it, because they are among the scholars who are widely circulated on Youtube social media and are famous for their opinions in the field of *tahlilan*, as well as scholars who are considered to have moderate opinions that are considered feasible and have the same competence, useful in analysing the two arguments of each camp. The technique of selecting sources is done by purposive and snowball. Data collection techniques were conducted in three ways, namely collecting and from pro and con informants, as well as moderate informants and the support of directories of books that discuss the topic under study (Dolores & Tongco, 2007).

The collected data was then thematically categorised based on the information provided by the informants. This process identifies information to find significant concepts. As a qualitative research, this process is carried out even in the first stage which involves online observations on YouTube in the second stage which involves drafting interview questions (Feenstra et al., 2022). The two parts were then brought together to find more meaningful conceptual categories related to the context of the research (Schepers & de Vries, 2022).

Data that had been conceptually categorised were then analysed and presented interpretatively and descriptively. Descriptive presentation is done by using *emic focus* to represent the terms put forward by informants or their perspectives on the problem under study (Hall et al., 2022); (Sugarman et al., 2018). While the interpretative presentation is carried out with an *ethic focus* to represent the terms that arise from the researcher's point of view.

3 Results

In a youtube with the title; *Tahlilan Is There any Dalil?* Ustadz Yazid Bin Abdul Qadir Jawas, who contradicts *tahlilan*, gives a clear explanation of the position of *Tahlilan* from the perspective of Islamic law (Uploaded, 15 October 2022). The following is an excerpt from his statement:

What if someone from the family organises tahlilan? You should try to advise them. Then ask them about the evidence for or against tahlilan. At the time of the Prophet (SAW), the first to die was the one who first believed in

the Prophet (SAW), who was Khadijah Bint Khuwailid radhiallahu'anha, the Prophet's wife whom the Prophet loved the most of all his wives, died. Did the Prophet hold a tahlilan or not? No, he didn't. His children died while the Prophet was still alive, all of his children died except one, who lived until six months after the death of the Prophet, Fatimah. All the Prophet's children died while the Prophet was alive but he did not hold tahlilan for his children. Companions of the Prophet who were loyal to the Prophet died while the Prophet was alive such as Hamzah Sayyidul Shuhada, Jafar Bin Abi Talib and others Radhiyallah anhum wa Ardah. The Prophet did not organise tahlilan. So where is the evidence?

In essence, the above passage explains that the basis of tahlilan practice should refer to what the Prophet SAW did during his lifetime. Looking at the reality, the experience of *tahlilan* in the time he was alive really did not exist, even though the moment that there should be *tahlil* was wide open. Verily, there is in the Messenger of Allah a good example for you (i.e.) for those who expect (the mercy of) Allah and (the coming of) the Day of Resurrection and who mention Allah much. (QS. Al-Ahzab (33): 21). This matter is non-negotiable, meaning that all charitable deeds performed must have the basis of what is exemplified or mentioned by the Prophet Muhammad. In fact, whatever is done, everything must be asked; whether the Prophet Muhammad SAW did it or said it or there are actions of friends approved by the Prophet Muhammad SAW, either directly by speech or at least he was silent (Sazali et al., 2022).

This argument draws on the notion of Hadith, which is anything that comes from the Prophet, be it speech, action, or confession (*taqrir*) (Bychawska-Siniarska, 2017). This means that there are three kinds, namely speech, which is the hadith of the Prophet Muhammad, which he uttered in various purposes and situations. There are also actions, namely everything that the Prophet Muhammad SAW did, such as the work of establishing five daily prayers with the procedures and pillars, and there is recognition, namely the actions of some of the companions of the Prophet who have been vowed by the Prophet SAW, whether the action is in the form of speech or action, while the pledge is sometimes by means of silence, and or giving birth to a good recognition of the action, so that with the pledge and approval. If a person does an action or expresses an utterance in the presence of the Prophet and then knows what the person is doing and is able to refute it, but the Prophet is silent and does not refute it, then it is an acknowledgement from the Prophet (Journal & Sirah, 2021).

The Salafi approach is textual, which is the earliest approach used in understanding the Prophet's traditions (Muzakki, 2019). This is because understanding a text is to first try to capture its original meaning, the popular and easy-to-understand meaning. If it is not understood, for various reasons, then other approaches are used. Textual comes from the word *text* which means the original words of the author, a quotation from scripture for teaching or reasoning, written material as a basis for teaching. The textual approach is a way of understanding hadith that tends to focus on history by emphasising the analysis from the grammatical point of view of language with the mindset of the *Bayani episteme* (Sazali et al., 2022). In summary, it can be formulated that the textual approach is to understand the meaning and intent contained in the Prophet's traditions by relying on the analysis of the hadith text.

After Ustadz Yazid Bin Abdul Qadir Jawas provided arguments for the rejection of tahlilan at the time of the Prophet, he explained and elaborated on examples of the absence of tahlil during the time of the Companions, after the Prophet died, by saying:

When the Prophet died, did any of his companions call for tahlilan for seven days, 14 days, 40 days and 100 days? No, they didn't. Or is there an opinion of Imam Shafi'i where Imam Shafi'i said so? All of these are made up, there is no evidence. There is no proof. Even the Companions were unanimous in saying that gathering at the place of death is the same as lamentation, and what is the ruling on lamentation? Haram. It was narrated that: We, the Companions, were unanimous in saying that gathering and eating at the place of death is wailing, and wailing is haram, and wailing is an act of ignorance.

This second part is a continuation of the previous one. If it is about the facts of the Prophet's time, then it is about the facts of the Companions' time. There was no practice of *tahlilan* after the Prophet died, even though he was buried after three days had passed (Mansoer et al., 2018). Moreover, those who died were companions who lived and fought with them. Even this Ustadz posed a challenge; is there an Imam Syafi'i *tahlil*, where is the evidence? This means that it shows that Imam Syafi'i did not do *tahlil* and did not recommend *tahlil*. Outwardly this statement is in line with what was narrated: *From Ummul Mu'minin; Umm Abdillah; 'Aisha Radhiyallahu 'Anha she said: The Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) said: "Whoever makes up something in our religion that is not part of it is rejected." (Narrated by Bukhari and Muslim), in the Muslim narration it is stated: "Whoever does an action for which we have no example is rejected." (narrated by Bukhari, 3:69).*

The ways of making decisions that have been discussed previously, are approaches that are commonly taken in a scientific perspective. Then how is the decision-making process in an Islamic perspective? Qualitative and quantitative approaches are all done with a scientific approach that involves human judgement. We as Muslims, based on (QS. Al-Ankabut (29): 2-3) can teach us to believe that every problem that exists comes from Allah, in finding solutions we should also involve Allah. There is nothing wrong with using *human judgement* in making decisions, but we must still believe that Allah is the best decision maker. *"You may hate something while it is very good for you, and you may love something while it is very bad for you; Allah knows and you do not know."* [QS. Al-Baqarah (2): 216].

It is clearly mentioned in QS. Al-Baqarah 216 above that Allah is the best place to return to when we are faced with a problem and in a decision-making process. It is not uncommon for us to then perform *Istikharah* prayers to involve Allah in every search for solutions to our problems. Prophet Muhammad SAW, said: "*If one of you intends to do something, perform two raka'ats of voluntary prayers that are not obligatory prayers, then pray to Allah*" [HR.Bukhari, 2: 57]. By performing *istikharah* prayer, it is hoped that it can prevent us from being subjective and concerned with lust. By praying *istikharah*, it can also eliminate indecision and bring about determination in choosing the best alternative. Amr Ibn Al-Ash narrated that he heard the Messenger of Allah (SAW) say, "*If a mujtahid is about to decide a matter then he does ijthihad and is right, then for him two rewards. And if he is about to solve a problem then he does ijthihad then wrong, then for him one reward.*" (HR.Nasai, 8: 223).

The above-mentioned Hadith explains that if a judge exerts effort in a certain matter and makes *ijthihad* in it until he reaches a conclusion that he believes to be correct in the matter, then he decides the law; if his decision is correct and in line with the truth, which is what Allah SWT wants in His rulings, then he will get two rewards: the reward for *ijthihad* and the reward for being right. On the other hand, if he does *ijthihad* but he does not reach the truth, then he will get one reward, the reward for *ijthihad*, because the *ijthihad* that he does in order to seek the truth is an act of worship. While he does not get the reward of correctness, he does not sin because it is not correct after he exerted *ijthihad* and hard work, provided that he is a person who is knowledgeable and competent to perform *ijthihad* (Rofiq, 2017).

In the other camp, the opposite opinion is represented by Buya Yahya who explains the Law of Carrying Out *Tahlilan*, *Here's How to Carry It Out* (Uploaded, 2 November 2022). In a youtube entitled: *Buya Yahya Answers Whether Tahlilan is Bid'ah*, he said:

Sharia is not only what the Prophet did. Religion is not only what the Prophet did. What the Prophet did was modelled. There is what the Prophet said, and what the Prophet said is understood and interpreted by scholars into various understandings. There is the silence of the Prophet, called iqrar, taqirinya Prophet. That also becomes a sharia. Now to judge whether or not the Prophet did it directly, that's not the case, that's an exaggerated sentence. This does not contradict the teachings of the Prophet. If the reason is that the Prophet never did it, there are so many forbidden things, and they are all hell. For example, the mixing of things. Assembly, radio, TV, that's worldly affairs, the Prophet did not explain there is a difference between the world and the hereafter. The Prophet only said, All heresy is dhalalah (heresy), there is no Prophet said all religious heretics are heretics, not so. The Prophet said all heresies are heretical, all heresies are heretical.

Unlike the previous camp, this camp states its principle, that sharia is not only what the Prophet did, even though it still puts forward the same meaning of the hadith as what the rejecting camp put forward. It's just that this camp does not specify that everything must be said by the Prophet or done or approved by him. To do so would mean that everything is bid'ah, and it would mean that the religion could not keep up with the times and technological advances. One of the most interesting things is to understand the hadith: *All innovations are heretical and all those who go astray will be put in hell* (Ibn Majah, 1:15) When given the separation between the affairs of worship and worldly affairs, who separates them, in the textual hadith there is no separation. This camp understands the hadith contextually.

The word "contextual" comes from "context", which in the Big Indonesian Dictionary has two meanings: a part of a description or sentence that can support or add clarity to the meaning; a situation that is related to an event. These two meanings can be used because they are inseparable terms in the study of Hadith understanding (Kadir, 2013). Contextual approach, according to Qamaruddin Hidayat, an interpreter positions a text into a network of discourse, it is likened to an iceberg, the text is a small phenomenon from the top of the mountain that appears on the surface. Therefore, without knowing the socio-cultural background from where and in what situation a text appears, it is difficult to capture the meaning of the message of a text. Similar to the Qur'an, a number of hadiths in an effort to understand are closely related to certain contexts, for example when the Prophet delivered news or behaved, acted or behaved, where, in what conditions, to whom he delivered, and so on (Afriani & Wijaya, 2021).

Contextual understanding of hadith according to Edi Safri is understanding the Prophet's traditions by paying attention to and studying their relationship with the events or situations that led to their emergence, or in other words, paying attention to and studying their context. Thus *asbab al-wurud* in contextual studies is the most important part. The broader study of contextual understanding is not only limited to *asbab al-wurud* in a special sense as commonly understood, but more broadly includes the historical-sociological context in which *asbab al-wurud* is part of it (Afriani & Wijaya, 2021). Thus, contextual understanding of the Prophetic traditions means understanding the traditions based on the events and situations when they were spoken and to whom they were addressed. That is, the Prophet's hadith is understood through its external wording and its contextual aspects. Although here it seems that the historical context is the most important aspect of a contextual approach, the editorial context cannot be ignored either. The latter aspect is equally important in order to limit and capture the broader meaning (philosophical meaning) so that the hadith remains communicative.

To the Prophet why dare to overdo this rule is problematic, the call to prayer twice on Friday, this was done by the Prophet's companions. From Sayyidina Uthman and the Companions all did the call to prayer twice and had a

purpose. Do you dare to say, the time of the Prophet alone there was no call to prayer twice. See, those who do not want to call to prayer twice usually say the Prophet did not do it. He does not realise that when he says that he has insulted Sayyidina Uthman is making a big mistake, because Sayyidina Uthman held the call to prayer twice. The tarwih prayer that you are doing was collected by Sayyidina Umar Bin Khattab. But why is it that Sayyidina Umar is not said to be bid'ah, why is Sayyidina Uthman also not said to be bid'ah like that. They were companions of the Prophet and scholars understood what the Prophet forbade and what was permissible.

In the continuation of the explanation, this group only refers to the words, actions and *taqir* of the Prophet, but extends to what the companions did, as people who directly met and mingled with the Prophet. Although it does not focus on *tahlil*, it gives examples of the actions of the Companions who dared to perform an act of worship that was not done at the time of the Prophet SAW. Among them Umar Ibn Khattab, a senior Companion and the second Caliph, dared to order *tarwih* prayers in congregation, carried out by Muslims until now, in various countries or congregations of Muslims. Whereas the Prophet only did it for three consecutive nights. Similarly, Uthman Ibn Affan, the senior companion and third caliph, dared to increase the call to Friday prayer twice. Whereas when the Prophet was alive, the call to Friday prayer was only once.

The narration that explains that Umar Ibn Khattab encouraged the Muslims to pray *tarwih* in congregation is: Once I went out to the Mosque with Umar Ibn Khattab r.a. one night in Ramadan, while the people were praying separately, some praying alone, some praying and then followed by a group of people. Then Umar said: "I saw that if I had gathered them under one Imam, it would have been better." (Ridlwani, 1970). Then he gathered them to Ubay Bin Ka'ab, then I went out with Umar on another night while the people were praying with their Imam, then Umar said: "The best Bid'ah is this, while the one who sleeps first then gets up at the end of the night is better, while the people do it at the beginning of the night." (HR. Bukhari, 3:45). So this narration is quite convincing because it was narrated by a well-known hadith imam and the validity of his narration is agreed upon, namely Imam Bukhari.

Regarding the addition of the adhan to the Friday prayer by Uthman bin Affan, it is narrated as follows: "During the time of the Prophet, Abu Bakr, and Umar, the call to prayer on Friday was initially only when the Imam sat on the pulpit. When Uthman bin Affan became caliph and the number of people had increased, he ordered the people to call for a third adhan, which was made on the *zaura'* (a place in the marketplace of Medina) and it was enforced from then on." (HR Bukhari, 2: 912). What is meant by the third adhan in the hadith is the first adhan that was called before the Friday time entered on the *zaura'*. The second adhan is the adhan when the preacher is seated on the pulpit, and the third adhan is the iqamah, which is announced just before the Friday prayer is offered. This is how the adhan for the Friday prayer was conducted in the early days of Islam.

In a very popular narration it is said: '*Ikhtilafu Ummati Rahmah* (the differences of my Ummah are mercy)' (Musnad Ahmad: 30), is a saying of the apostle that is well known to Muslims. Regardless of whether this hadith is authentic or not, the content of the hadith is very factual and logical. If the difference is illustrated by a painting, then if a painting is all white, or all green, will it look beautiful? A hand with five fingers and different shapes and lengths, do the five fingers blame each other? How would a guitar sound if all the strings were the same? It is likely that this hadith became the rationale for Westerners to create the conflict management theories that are widely studied in management, including Muslims (Saiful Amir, 2022).

Historically, differences followed by mutual reproach and blame have occurred in Islamic history. Ali bin Abi Talib and Muawiyah were both companions of the prophet who had to fight each other because they disbelieved each other. The strength that had been gathered for a long time broke instantly, there was no more brotherhood, there was only self-justification and blaming others and given the degree of 'kafir' and halal blood. This is a valuable lesson for Muslims after them (Tabi'in et al., 2022). The lesson that must be considered in the difference is the difference taken by the scholars of the *mazahib arba'ah* (four madhhabs). The differences they express are not a division but an agreement in difference, agreeing even though they disagree with a high sense of tolerance. Whatever mazhab is adopted by the Muslims, the founders of the mazhab never criticise or blame them (Muhamad Mu'izz Abdullah & Awang, 2021).

The current condition of humanity has caused a lot of concern, the existing reality shows that Muslims have divided into many groups (Gentile, 2019). Between one another, they have different principles, sometimes even contradicting each other, such as the two groups that are pro and contra in the position of *tahlilan*. This fact is proof of the truth of the Prophet's *nubuwwah* (prophethood). He has been preaching this *iftiraqul ummah* (division of the Muslim Ummah) since his lifetime. Despite this, we should not resign ourselves to the fact that we are commanded to follow the Shari'ah in all circumstances. The Shari'ah has ordered us to unite on *al-haq*, on the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him). One of the most important things to unite this ummah is that the ummah must follow the rules of understanding the Qur'an and Hadith (Abdul Qoyum et al., 2021).

Maintaining Islamic brotherhood is one of the Islamic morals that is the most important basis of Islamic society after *Tawhidullah*, or the Oneness of Allah. Ukhuwah or Islamic brotherhood is the main means for '*izzul Islam wal-muslimin*. Ukhuwah and Islamic brotherhood are the closest way to obtain Allah's forgiveness and *pleasure* (Soleman & Hamja, 2022). The essence of Ukhuwah Islamiyah does not mean having one stance and one opinion in all matters, but lies in the attitude of the heart and soul. Allah SWT conveyed in the Quran that to realise Ukhuwah Islamiyah and create

compassion among humans requires the Rahman and Rahim of Allah SWT. Some steps ordered by the Quran to maintain and preserve Ukhuwah Islamiyah. Even if there are differences in the matter of religious understanding, brotherhood must be made the highest and most important matter (Susilowati et al., 2019).

When there is a difference of opinion among Muslims, we should all be ready to abandon our own opinion and follow the opinion of others, if it turns out that the other person's opinion is based on a verse of the Quran or a *saheeh hadith*, while our opinion is not based on reliable evidence. (Hendricks, 2010). "If you are in conflict on a matter, then refer it back to Allah (the Quran) and to the Messenger of Allah (Al-Hadith)." (QS. An-Nisa', (4): 59). Another thing that is no less important in realising Ukhuwah Islamiyah is the ability of each of us to avoid ourselves from various attitudes that can crack the joints of ukhuwah and can shake the foundations of brotherhood. The most important thing is to uphold *akhlaqul kharimah, akhlaq ukhuwah islamiyah*.

Looking at the arguments used by the two opposing camps about the law of *tahlilan*, it is actually substantively not seen as a contradiction (*tadhadd*), but only limited to diversity (*tanawwu'*). The arguments used are not out of the provisions contained in the Qur'an and hadith, only about the general and the specific. The camp that contradicts *tahlilan* sees and uses special arguments for special moments, while the camp that is *pro-tahlilan* sees and uses general arguments, including for special cases (Salafuddin, 2021). In understanding the arguments used, the contrasting camp understands them textually as they are, in accordance with the reality that starts from the Prophet's words, actions to taqir, the Prophet's approval. While the pro camp understands the arguments contextually so that it can enter into all niches of the problem both in the affairs of *diniyyah* and *dunyawiyyah* affairs. That means, this problem does not need to be questioned.

Thus it can be seen that the two opposing camps are one and there is no scientific reason to contradict them. The issue of *tahlilan* is not a matter of principle in Islamic teachings, compared to the issue of the importance of maintaining *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah*, which could be fatal to Islam and the Muslims if this issue is ignored. Each of the opposing camps on the ruling on *tahlilan*, both those who disagree with *tahlilan* and those who agree and practice *tahlilan*, should be fully aware of the smallness of this issue compared to other issues that are more for the benefit of Islam and the Muslims, arguing about it is just a waste of energy. Go back to what Allah says in the Qur'an: *Hold fast to the rope of Allah and do not be divided*.

4 Discussion

In the Indonesian language wiktionary, one meaning of the word *mengawinkan* is; blending (combining) two different things to achieve something good (Arshad et al., 2012). The disparity between sector-specific and citizen-wide policy mixes as a sense of analysis to investigate this information in research on neighbourhood mixes (Jonek-Kowalska, 2022). In other wording, it is also mentioned by combining different opinions. Moving to a deeper level of analysing the results by considering the confusion matrix. We noticed that the number of true positives is significant for all studied algorithms. Future work will entail applying our general approach to other data and problems (Saidi & Trabelsi, 2022).

In the study of Islamic law, efforts to find solutions by combining two different opinions are called *Al-Jam'u wa taufiq*, which is to collect arguments that appear contradictory, then compromise them, the result of this compromise is the result of the law. Finally, the relationship between *al-jam'u wa taufiq* and *tawaquf* is both part of the procedure in overcoming *taarudh al-adillah* (Fathoni, 2020). Christopher Pieper (2022) mentions that research shows that the concept of peace has evolved over time, and that the pursuit of "peace" as a goal is itself a relatively new phenomenon. Because it remains a polysemic and controversial term, not a few tyrants have committed heinous acts of violence on the path to peace. However, the interdependent nature of modern life makes the prospect and hope of lasting peace more promising than in most previous periods of history (Garrett, 2010).

According to the Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia (KBBI), the meaning of the word opposition is an opposition party in the legislature whose function is to oppose and criticise the opinions and political policies of the ruling group. Another meaning of opposition is the opposition between two language elements to show differences in meaning (Auxéméry, 2021). Eep Saifullah Fatah says that the opposition is every speech and action that will straighten out mistakes while underlining and supporting everything that is right. So, the intention is to carry out supervisory activities on political power that can be wrong and right. While in political science, the definition of this term is a party with a policy or stance that is contrary to the policy line of the group running a government (Eep Saifullah Fatah, 2000).

Opposition as a group or party that disagrees with or does not support a political policy that is being delivered (López & Rosas, 2022). Opposition often plays an important role in politics, namely in controlling the course of government so that it remains in accordance with a corridor of law and national values (Laako & Kauffer, 2022). The format itself is in the form of the teachings of balancing the power (*check and balance*) of the state which is then placed in the framework of the constitution. The *check and balance* system itself is a mechanism to be able to correct and straighten out a government and encourage growth towards a better direction. Therefore, any restriction of freedom and restraint in expressing thoughts is a very principle violation of the demands of a state's philosophy or human rights (Bychawska-

Siniarska, 2017).

Aichner et al that, social media is a web-based social networking site that makes it possible for individuals to build public or semi-public profiles in a restricted system (Aichner et al., 2021), list other users with whom they are connected, and view and explore their list of connections made by others with a system (Untari & Fajariana, 2018). Meanwhile, according to Phillip Kotler and Kevin Keller, social media is a means for consumers to share text, images, video and audio information with each other and with companies and vice versa (Abda'u et al., 2018). **Social media is an online media, where users can easily participate, share, and create.** YouTube is one of the social media with a website that provides a variety of videos ranging from video clips to films, as well as videos created by YouTube users themselves (Menon, 2022).

Where we can enjoy this social media by watching videos or moving images. And we know that YouTube is very easy to use and is now available on mobile phone applications. **Social media is an online medium, where users can easily participate, share, and create.** YouTube is one of the social media with a website that provides a variety of videos ranging from video clips to films, as well as videos created by YouTube users themselves. Where we can enjoy this social media by watching videos or moving images. And we know that YouTube is very easy to use and is now present in the mobile phone application (Abdullahi et al., 2021). YouTube is one of the most popular social media now. Where now many people use YouTube as a place to work, especially for young people.

The word *tahlilan*, or *tahlil* - the same meaning - is derived from an Arabic word (*hallala-yuhallilu-tahlilan*) which means reciting the phrase *La ilaha illa Allah*. *Tahlilan* has become a deep-rooted tradition among Indonesian Muslims, especially those who claim to be followers of Ahli Sunnah Wal Jamaah. *Tahlilan* becomes a routine activity every Friday night (Warisno & Tabrani, 2018). *Tahlilan* has become a routine activity every Friday night (Sasagara & Badrun, 2022), and on special occasions, such as sending prayers for deceased relatives, it is organised in congregation in a council. Viewed from a Scientific Perspective (Historical, Sociological, Psychological, Anthropological), *tahlilan* When viewed from a historical perspective, the *tahlilan* tradition actually has the nuances of "islamization" carried out by the ulama' or kiyai in the past. (Nasir, 2019).

From a psychological perspective, the *tahlilan* tradition on the days of mourning is actually very helpful for *shahib al-muṣibah*, because on those days, 1-7 days, even 40 and 100 days the family left behind is usually still grief-stricken (Mas'ari & Syamsuatir, 2017). It is at such times that if for 1-7 days *tahlilan* is held, then they will be comforted or feel a lot of relatives. This is the meaning of *ta'ziyah*, which means comforting (the family of the deceased). Anthropologically speaking, humans have spiritual and ritualistic tendencies, so whatever religion or belief they profess, they must have an attachment to something that is considered powerful in this universe. In this context, religious people (whatever their religion) have spiritual and ritualistic tendencies, and this is part of their doctrine. Therefore, in the context of *tahlil*, it is actually also a part of ritualism that brings rewards and God's love (Manan, 2015). Because in the *tahlilan* tradition itself, the sentences that are read are *kalimah thayyibah*.

5 Conclusion

The rejection of *tahlilan* by the Salafi Wahabi camp that is widely witnessed on social media can be understood, that their openness and frankness as an effort of this camp in maintaining their belief that the arguments, both Al-Quran and hadith are sufficiently understood textually and binding for a certain time and place. No analogy formula can be used in this matter. Meanwhile, the camp that practices *tahlilan* understands that the propositions of *tahlilan* are understood contextually, so that their practice becomes broader and not bound by time and place. With an attitude of socialising and defending its opinion, this camp uploads its understanding through social media. So far, these two camps have been very insistent on maintaining their respective understandings, so that it seems as if there is no path of resolution between the understandings of these two opposing camps.

This finding can have implications for the terminology of *tahlilan* worship as a religious leader in the new media era, which will coincide with the terminology of opinion makers and opinion leaders as new terminology in the new media era. It is fully realised that there is a difference between *tahlil* and *tahlilan*. When *tahlil* is interpreted as the main dhikr that is very high in value. It is legalised by the Prophet as a sentence taught by living people to people who are in torpor, even a sentence that can be called a ticket to enter heaven if someone can make it the last sentence. *Tahlilan* is a ritual/celebration performed by some Muslims, mostly in Indonesia and possibly in Malaysia, to commemorate and pray for the deceased which is usually performed on the first day of death until the seventh day, and then performed on the 40th, 100th, first, second, third year and so on. There are also those who perform *tahlilan* on the 1000th day. So, *tahlilan* is the name of a ceremony in which *tahlil* is recited.

The discourse on the rejection and acceptance of *tahlilan* in Indonesia is increasingly being discussed as a topic of conversation by netizens on social media, especially YouTube. As well as the scholars who reject *tahlilan* activities understand the power of YouTube as a means to persuade, influence, or shape public opinion. This phenomenon shows that in this YouTube era, there is a shift in the understanding of the ulama who counter as religious leaders to become opinion makers. However, this shift actually strengthens each cleric as a religious authority. Therefore, this finding may have

implications for the new definition of *tahlilan*, resulting in a new definition of *tahlilan* in today's new media era. This new definition, if understood with intelligence and awareness, will result in peace in the dealings of fellow Muslims.

Ethical Approval

This study does not contain any studies with human or animal participants performed by the author.

Informed Consent

This was a systematic review for previously published studies no informed consent was needed in this study.

Conflict of Interests

The author has not any conflict of interests with the information presented within this article.

References

- Abda'u, P. D., Winarno, W. W., & Henderi, H. (2018). Evaluasi Penerapan SIMRS Menggunakan Metode HOT-Fit di RSUD dr. Soedirman Kebumen. *INTENSIF: Jurnal Ilmiah Penelitian Dan Penerapan Teknologi Sistem Informasi*, 2(1), 46. <https://doi.org/10.29407/intensif.v2i1.11817>
- Abdul Qoyum, Asep Nurhalim, & Fithriady. (2021). *Sejarah Pemikiran Ekonomi Islam*. Departemen Ekonomi dan Keuangan Syariah - Bank Indonesia.
- Abdullahi, K. A., Oladele, O. I., & Akinyemi, M. (2021). Attitude, knowledge and constraints associated with the use of mobile phone applications by farmers in North West Nigeria. *Journal of Agriculture and Food Research*, 6, 100212. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jafr.2021.100212>
- Afriani, A., & Wijaya, F. (2021). Pendekatan Tekstual Dan Kontekstual Dalam Study Hadist. *JOURNAL OF ALIFBATA: Journal of Basic Education (JBE)*, 1(1), 37–54. <https://doi.org/10.51700/alifbata.v1i1.91>
- Aichner, T., Grünfelder, M., Maurer, O., & Jegeni, D. (2021). Twenty-Five Years of Social Media: A Review of Social Media Applications and Definitions from 1994 to 2019. *Cyberpsychology, Behavior, and Social Networking*, 24(4), 215–222. <https://doi.org/10.1089/cyber.2020.0134>
- Arshad, I. S. M. R. @, Rozali, E. A., & Kamaruzzaman, A. F. (2012). The Importance of Learning Islamic History and Civilization of Malaysia in the Building of Human Capital and Identity of the Muslim Society in Malaysia. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 59, 550–557. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.09.313>
- Auxéméry, Y. (2021). Psychic Trauma Disturbs Networks of Meaning and Constitutes a Linguistic Wound. *L'Évolution Psychiatrique*, 86(2), e1–e20. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.evopsy.2021.03.003>
- Barber, M., Gardner, J., & Carter, A. (2023). SSM - Qualitative Research in Health Transformative agents of change and investigative neurotechnologies: A qualitative study of psychedelic technology identities. *SSM - Qualitative Research in Health*, 3(November 2022), 100202. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssmqr.2022.100202>
- Bychawska-Siniarska, D. (2017). *Protecting the Right to Freedom of Expression Under the European Convention on Human Rights: A Handbook for Legal Practitioners*. 1–115. <https://rm.coe.int/handbook-freedom-of-expression-eng/1680732814>
- Dolores, M., & Tongco, C. (2007). Definition of Purposive Sampling. *A Journal of Plants, People and Applied Research*, 5, 1–12. <https://ethnobotanyjournal.org/index.php/era/article/view/126>
- Eep Saifullah Fatah. (2000). *Pengkhianatan Demokrasi ala Orde Baru*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Fathoni, K. (2020). Metode Penyelesaian Ta'arudh al-Adillah dalam Metodologi Hukum Islam. *AL-MANHAJ: Jurnal Hukum Dan Pranata Sosial Islam*, 2(1), 45–64. <https://doi.org/10.37680/almanhaj.v2i1.309>
- Feenstra, T. M., Mak-van der Vossen, M. C., Schijven, M. P., & Nieveen van Dijkum, E. J. M. (2022). Digital Training Resources in the Dutch Surgical Residency Curricula and the Perspectives of Residents: A Thematic Analysis of Resident Interviews. *Journal of Surgical Education*, 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jsurg.2022.10.015>
- Garrett, B. (2010). Sino-American relations in the era of globalization - A framework for analysis. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 2(5), 7249–7267. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.05.080>

- Gentile, M. (2019). Geopolitical fault-line cities in the world of divided cities. *Political Geography*, 71(April), 126–138. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polgeo.2019.03.002>
- Hall, M. E. L., McMartin, J., Park, C. L., Sacco, S. J., Kim, D., Kapic, K., Silverman, E., Shannonhouse, L., Aten, J., Snow, L. M., & Lopez, L. (2022). Suffering with Christ: Emic christian coping and relation to well-being. *SSM - Mental Health*, 2(April), 100158. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssmmh.2022.100158>
- Hendricks, M. (2010). Islamic Texts : A Source for Acceptance of Queer Individuals into Mainstream Muslim Society. *The Equal Rights Review*, 5, 31–51.
- Jalli, N., Joharry, S. A., & Salleh, S. M. (2022). ICERD in Malaysian online news reports: Analysis of rhetoric and public opinion. *Social Sciences & Humanities Open*, 6(1), 100318. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssaho.2022.100318>
- Jonek-Kowalska, I. (2022). Multi-criteria evaluation of the effectiveness of energy policy in Central and Eastern European countries in a long-term perspective. *Energy Strategy Reviews*, 44(September), 100973. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.esr.2022.100973>
- Journal, T. H. E., & Sirah, O. F. (2021). *The Life of the Prophet Muhammad in Terms of Battles and Expeditions. December*, 0–2.
- Kadir, Abdul. (2013). Konsep Pembelajaran Kontekstual Di Sekolah. *Dinamika Ilmu*, 13(1), 17–38. http://journal.iain-samarinda.ac.id/index.php/dinamika_ilmu/article/view/20
- Laako, H., & Kauffer, E. (2022). Between colonising waters and extracting forest fronts: Entangled eco-frontiers in the Usumacinta River Basin. *Political Geography*, 96(February), 102566. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polgeo.2021.102566>
- López, F., & Rosas, G. (2022). COVID-19 and attitudes towards early withdrawal of pension funds: The role of trust and political ideology*. *The Journal of the Economics of Ageing*, 23(November), 100420. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeoa.2022.100420>
- Ma'arif, Yahya Zainul. "Review of Islamic Law on the Practice of Tahlilan in Indonesia." *Saudi Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences* 7, no. 12 (2022): 474–78. doi:10.36348/sjhs.2022.v07i12.003.
- Mansoer, M., Ulya, A., & Sofwan, N. (2018). *Living Hadith: the Phenomena of Fidyah Prayer and Fasting Tradition in Indramayu*. 137(Icqh 2017), 256–262. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icqhs-17.2018.40>
- Margono, H. (2019). *Analysis of the Indonesian Cyberbullying through Data Mining: The Effective Identification of Cyberbullying through Characteristics of Messages*. 255. <http://vuir.vu.edu.au/%0Ahttp://files/2191/Margono - 2019 - Analysis of the Indonesian Cyberbullying through D.pdf%0Ahttp://files/2190/39499.html>
- Mas'ari, A., & Syamsuatir. (2017). Tradisi Tahlilan : Potret Akulturasi Agama dan Budaya Khas Islam Nusantara Tradition Tahlilan : Portrait Acculturation Islam Religion and Culture Typical Nusantara. *KONTEKSTUALITA Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Dan Keagamaan*, 33(1), 78–95.
- Maulidi, A. R. (2021). Moderate Behavior of Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) as a Role Model in Encountering Pluralism moderate that Gus Mus said , “ Islam is moderate . If it is not moderate , Islamic texts which always call for a middle attitude and prohibit an (PBUH) , moderate va. *International Journal Ihya' 'Ulum Al-Din*, 23(2), 152–172.
- Menon, D. (2022). Purchase and continuation intentions of over -the -top (OTT) video streaming platform subscriptions: a uses and gratification theory perspective. *Telematics and Informatics Reports*, 5(January 2022), 100006. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.teler.2022.100006>
- Muhamad Mu'izz Abdullah, & Awang, A. B. (2021). تمهيدية دراسة "الأوطار نيل كتابه في الأربعة للمذاهب المستقلة الفقهية الشوكاتي مناهج. *BITARA International Journal of Civilizational Studies and Human Sciences Volume 4, Issue 3, 2021 The*, 4(3), 62–85.
- Muzakki, K. A. (2019). Salafi's Textualism in Understanding Qur'an and Hadith. *Journal of Qur'an and Hadith Studies*, 8(1), 18–33. <https://doi.org/10.15408/quhas.v8i1.13378>
- Nasir, M. A. (2019). Revisiting the Javanese Muslim Slametan: Islam, local tradition, honor and symbolic communication. *Al-Jami'ah*, 57(2), 329–358. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2019.572.329-358>
- Nawawi, Wawan Juandi, Maskuri, R. Fakhrurrazi, and Djuwairiyah. "Moderation of Islam and Local Culture in Indonesia : An Argument of Islamic Law." *Italienisch* 12, no. 2 (2022): 744–52. <https://www.italienisch.nl/index.php/VerlagSauerlander/article/view/400>. Macagno, F., Rapanta, C., Mayweg-Paus, E., & Garcia-Milà, M. (2022). Coding empathy in dialogue. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 192, 116–132. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2022.02.011>

- Ridliwan, N. A. (1970). Pendekatan Sejarah Kajian Hadits-Hadits Tarawih. *KOMUNIKA: Jurnal Dakwah Dan Komunikasi*, 6(2). <https://doi.org/10.24090/komunika.v6i2.358>
- Rofiq, A. (2017). Teori Kebenaran dalam Pemikiran Hukum Al-Ghazaly: Kajian Filosofis-Metodologis. *International Journal Ihya' 'Ulum Al-Din*, 18(2), 181. <https://doi.org/10.21580/ihya.17.2.1736>
- Saidi, F., & Trabelsi, Z. (2022). A hybrid deep learning-based framework for future terrorist activities modeling and prediction. *Egyptian Informatics Journal*, 23(3), 437–446. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eij.2022.04.001>
- Saiful Amir. (2022). *Kajian Sosiologi Islam*. PT. Nas Media Indonesia.
- Salafuddin, A. (2021). Manarul Qur'an. *Manarul Qur'an: Jurnal Ilmiah Studi Islam*, 21(1412–7075), 63–80. https://www.academia.edu/28519916/Jurnal_Unsiq
- Sazali, S. S., Rahman, N. A., & Bakar, Z. A. (2022). Characteristics of Malay translated hadith corpus. *Journal of King Saud University - Computer and Information Sciences*, 34(5), 2151–2160. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jksuci.2020.07.011>
- Schepers, M., & de Vries, K. M. (2022). A conceptual model for botany–ceramics relations. *Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports*, 45(September), 103637. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jasrep.2022.103637>
- Sirait, S. (2016). Religious Attitudes of Theological Tradisional In The Modern Muslim Community Study on Tahlilan in Kotagede Sangkot Sirait tahlilan . According to Muhammadiyah , tahlilan tradition is another form communities . Muhammadiyah teaching standards consider. *Journal of Indonesian Islam*, 10(02), 237–260.
- Soleman, S. H., & Hamja, B. (2022). *Building Islamic Ukhuwah Towards True People Establish Graceand Break Fast With The Faculty Of Law With Regional Leaders Muhammadiyah North Maluku*. 366–368. <https://doi.org/10.51601/ijcs.v2i3.118>
- Suadi, A. (2018). Peranan Peradilan Agama dalam Melindungi Hak Perempuan dan Anak Melalui Putusan yang Memihak dan Dapat Dilaksanakan. *Jurnal Hukum Dan Peradilan*, 7(3), 353.
- Sugarman, J., Barker, R. A., Kerridge, I., Lysaght, T., Pellegrini, G., Sipp, D., & Tanner, C. (2018). Tackling Ethical Challenges of Premature Delivery of Stem Cell-Based Therapies: ISSCR 2018 Annual Meeting Focus Session Report. *Stem Cell Reports*, 11(5), 1021–1025. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stemcr.2018.10.020>
- Susilowati, I., Yunus, N. R., & Sholeh, M. (2019). Politics of Identity on Great 212's Reunion. *Dauliyah Journal of Islamic and International Affairs*, 4(1), 58–79. <https://ejournal.unida.gontor.ac.id/index.php/dauliyah/article/view/2933>
- Tabi'in, A., Hasibuan, L., & US, K. A. (2022). Pendidikan Islam, Perubahan Sosial, dan Pembangunan di Indonesia. *Asatiza: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 3(1), 48–59. <https://doi.org/10.46963/asatiza.v3i1.469>
- Untari, D., & Fajariana, D. E. (2018). Strategi Pemasaran Melalui Media Sosial Instagram (Studi Deskriptif Pada Akun @Subur_Batik). *Widya Cipta*, 2(2), 271–278. <http://ejournal.bsi.ac.id/ejurnal/index.php/widyacipta>
- Warisno, A., & Tabrani, Z. A. (2018). The Local Wisdom and Purpose of Tahlilan Tradition . *Advanced Science Letters*, 24(10), 7082–7086. <https://doi.org/10.1166/asl.2018.12413>
- Woo, J. (2022). SSM - Qualitative Research in Health An intersectional life-course perspective on Black women ' s smoking trajectories. *SSM - Qualitative Research in Health*, 2(November), 100196. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssmqr.2022.100196>

Reconciling Two Contradictory Understandings about the Law of Tahlilan on Social Media Indonesia

ORIGINALITY REPORT

11 %
SIMILARITY INDEX

7 %
INTERNET SOURCES

6 %
PUBLICATIONS

7 %
STUDENT PAPERS

MATCH ALL SOURCES (ONLY SELECTED SOURCE PRINTED)

2%
★ www.researchgate.net
Internet Source

Exclude quotes Off
Exclude bibliography On

Exclude matches Off